

APPENDIX PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION.....	3
2. SOLE REMEDY	3
3. DEFINITIONS	3
4. SPECIFIED PERFORMANCE STANDARDS.....	4
5. OCCURRENCE OF A SPECIFIED PERFORMANCE BREACH.....	5
6. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES AS FORM OF REMEDY	5
7. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES PAYMENT PLAN; GENERALLY	5
8. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES; METHOD OF CALCULATION.....	6
9. TABLE OF CRITICAL VALUES.....	9
10. LIMITATIONS	11
11. RECORDS AND REPORTS.....	11
12. AUDITS.....	13
13. INITIAL IMPLEMENTATION	13
14. PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENTS	14

APPENDIX PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENTS

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 AT&T Inc. (AT&T) means the holding company which owns the following ILECs: Illinois Bell Telephone Company, Indiana Bell Telephone Company Incorporated, Michigan Bell Telephone Company, Nevada Bell Telephone Company, The Ohio Bell Telephone Company, Pacific Bell Telephone Company, The Southern New England Telephone Company, Southwestern Bell Telephone Company and/or Wisconsin Bell, Inc. d/b/a AT&T Wisconsin.
- 1.2 As used herein, AT&T Wisconsin means the applicable above listed ILEC doing business in Wisconsin.
- 1.3 As used herein, **Service Bureau Provider** means a company which has been engaged by CLEC to act as its agent for purposes of accessing AT&T-LEC's OSS application-to-application interfaces.
- 1.4 The performance measurements contained herein, notwithstanding any provisions in any other appendix in this Agreement, are not intended to create, modify or otherwise affect parties' rights and obligations with respect to OSS access. The existence of any particular performance measure, or the language describing that measure, is not evidence that CLEC is entitled to any particular manner of access, nor is it evidence that AT&T Wisconsin is limited to providing any particular manner of access. The parties' rights and obligations to such access are defined elsewhere, including the relevant laws, FCC and PUC decisions/regulations, tariffs, and within this interconnection agreement.

2. SOLE REMEDY

- 2.1 These liquidated damages shall be the sole and exclusive remedy of CLEC for AT&T Wisconsin's failure to meet specified performance measures and shall be in lieu of any other damages CLEC might otherwise seek for such breach through any claim or suit brought under any contract or tariff.

3. DEFINITIONS

- 3.1 When used in this Appendix, the following terms will have the meanings indicated:
 - 3.1.1 Performance Criteria
 - 3.1.1.1 The target level of AT&T Wisconsin performance specified for each Performance Measurement. Generally, the Performance Measurements contained in this Appendix specify performance

equal to that which AT&T Wisconsin achieves for itself in providing equivalent end user service as the Performance Criterion. Parity exists when the measured results in a single month (whether in the form of means, proportions, or rates) for the same measure, at equivalent disaggregation for both AT&T Wisconsin and CLEC are used to calculate an appropriate test statistic and the resulting test value has an associated probability that is no less than the critical probability indicated in the Table of Critical Values shown in Section 9.

3.1.1.2 Performance Measurements for which parity calculations are not possible have a specified *standard* as the Performance Criterion. Compliance is assessed by comparing the result obtained by CLEC with the applicable standard using an appropriate statistical test. The result is compliant if the probability associated with the test statistic is no less than the critical probability indicated in the Table of Critical Values shown in Section 9. The Parties acknowledge that not all metrics with a specified *standard* will have a statistical test applied to such metrics.

3.1.2 Performance Measures

3.1.2.1 The set of measures listed in all of Section 14 of this Appendix.

3.1.3 Non-compliance

3.1.3.1 The failure by AT&T Wisconsin to meet the Performance Criteria for any performance measure identified as an available measurement type in Section 14.

4. SPECIFIED PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

4.1 AT&T Wisconsin shall not be obligated to pay liquidated damages or assessments for noncompliance with a performance measurement to the extent that such noncompliance was the result of actions or events beyond AT&T Wisconsin's control, including but not limited to the following: (i) a Force Majeure event; (ii) an act or omission by CLEC that is contrary to any of its obligations under its interconnection agreement with AT&T Wisconsin or law; (iii) environmental events beyond AT&T Wisconsin's control even though not considered "Force Majeure"; and (iv) problems associated with third-party systems or equipment including systems, equipment and services provided by Service Bureau Provider, which could not be avoided by AT&T Wisconsin through the exercise of reasonable diligence, regardless of whether or not such third-party systems or equipment were sold to or otherwise being provided to AT&T Wisconsin.

5. OCCURRENCE OF A SPECIFIED PERFORMANCE BREACH

5.1 In recognition of either: 1) the loss of End User opportunities, revenues and goodwill which CLEC might sustain in the event of a Specified Performance Breach; 2) the uncertainty, in the event of a Specified Performance Breach, of CLEC having available to its End User opportunities similar to those opportunities available to AT&T Wisconsin at the time of a breach; or 3) the difficulty of accurately ascertaining the amount of damages CLEC would sustain if a Specified Performance Breach occurs, AT&T Wisconsin agrees to pay CLEC Liquidated Damages, subject to Section 6.1 below.

6. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES AS FORM OF REMEDY

6.1 The Parties agree and acknowledge that a) the Liquidated Damages are not a penalty and have been determined based upon the facts and circumstances known by the Parties at the time of the negotiation and entering into this Agreement, with due consideration given to the performance expectations of each Party; b) the Liquidated Damages constitute a reasonable approximation of the damages CLEC would sustain if its damages were readily ascertainable; c) neither Party will be required to provide any proof of Liquidated Damages; and d) the Liquidated Damages provided herein will constitute full compensation for any failure of AT&T Wisconsin to meet a specified performance commitment in this Appendix and any specific time commitments for the same activity contained in any other Appendix or Appendices.

7. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES PAYMENT PLAN; GENERALLY

7.1 Liquidated damages apply to the available, non-diagnostic measurements of the FCC Merger Conditions designated in Section 14 below, when AT&T Wisconsin delivers non-compliant performance as defined in 3.1.3. In no event shall AT&T Wisconsin be required to pay liquidated damages for any performance which was at parity or in compliance with the applicable benchmark at the time that the performance occurred.

7.2 The Table of Critical Values (Section 9) gives the maximum number, F, of measurements of those required to be reported to CLEC that may fail the Performance Criteria in any month. Liquidated damages apply to non-compliant measures that are in excess of the applicable value of F.

7.3 None of the liquidated damages provisions set forth in this proposal will apply during the first three months after CLEC first purchases the type of service or unbundled network element(s) associated with a particular performance measurement or introduction of a new measure, unless AT&T Wisconsin is ordered to do so by the Commission or the FCC.

7.4 There are two kinds of failures of the Performance Criteria. *Ordinary* failures are

failures on a measure for one month or two consecutive months. *Chronic* failures are failures on a measure for three consecutive months. Ordinary failures may be excused up to the applicable value of F from the Table of Critical Values. Chronic failures may not be excused in that manner. \$500 is paid for each ordinary failure in excess of F. \$2,500 is paid for each Chronic failure. For example, if the value of F is 8 and there are 10 Ordinary failures and 1 Chronic failure in a month, then the Liquidated Damages for that month would be $(10-8)*\$500 + \$2,500 = \$3,500$. If there were 7 Ordinary failures and no Chronic failures, no Liquidated Damages would be paid.

8. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES; METHOD OF CALCULATION

- 8.1 AT&T Wisconsin and CLEC agree to use the following as statistical tests for evaluating the compliance of CLEC results with the Performance Criterion. These tests are applicable if the number of data points for each of AT&T Wisconsin and CLEC is greater than or equal to 30 for a given measurement. Methods for statistical testing are subject to periodic review and modification as directed or ordered by the Commission or FCC.
- 8.2 The following list describes the tests to be used in evaluating the performance criterion. In each test, the important concept is the probability that CLEC's results are significantly worse than either the comparable result for AT&T Wisconsin or the benchmark (whichever is relevant to the test). This probability is compared with the P value from the Table of Critical Values to decide if the measure meets the Performance Criterion. Probabilities that are less than the P value are deemed to have failed the test.

For parity measures that are expressed as Averages or Means, the following (Modified) Z test applies:

$$Z = (\text{DIFF}) / \delta_{\text{DIFF}}$$

Where;

$$\text{DIFF} = M_{\text{ILEC}} - M_{\text{CLEC}}$$

M_{ILEC} = ILEC Average

M_{CLEC} = CLEC Average

$$\delta_{\text{DIFF}} = \text{SQRT} [\delta_{\text{ILEC}}^2 (1/n_{\text{CLEC}} + 1/n_{\text{ILEC}})]$$

δ_{ILEC}^2 = Calculated variance for ILEC.

n_{ILEC} = number of observations or samples used in ILEC measurement

n_{CLEC} = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The probability of the Z statistic is obtained from a standard normal distribution.

For parity measures that are expressed as Percentages or Proportions:

$$Z = (\text{DIFF}) / \delta_{\text{DIFF}}$$

Where;

$$\text{DIFF} = P_{\text{ILEC}} - P_{\text{CLEC}}$$

P_{ILEC} = ILEC Proportion

P_{CLEC} = CLEC Proportion

$$\delta_{\text{DIFF}} = \text{SQRT} [\delta_{\text{ILEC}}^2 (1/n_{\text{CLEC}} + 1/n_{\text{ILEC}})]$$

$$\delta_{\text{ILEC}}^2 = P_{\text{ILEC}} (1 - P_{\text{ILEC}}).$$

n_{ILEC} = number of observations or samples used in ILEC measurement

n_{CLEC} = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The probability of the Z statistic is obtained from a standard normal distribution.

In the event that $P_{\text{ILEC}} = 0$ (and low values are associated with good service), the above test cannot be used. In such cases, Fisher's Exact Test is used to calculate the probability, P_{FE} , of the data given the hypothesis of parity.:

$$P_{\text{FE}} = 1 - \sum_{x=0}^{H_{\text{CLEC}}-1} \frac{\binom{n_{\text{CLEC}}}{x} \binom{n_{\text{ILEC}}}{H_{\text{CLEC}}+H_{\text{ILEC}}-x}}{\binom{n_{\text{CLEC}}+n_{\text{ILEC}}}{H_{\text{CLEC}}+H_{\text{ILEC}}}}$$

Where;

$$H_{\text{CLEC}} = P_{\text{CLEC}} n_{\text{CLEC}}$$

$$H_{\text{ILEC}} = P_{\text{ILEC}} n_{\text{ILEC}}.$$

If $P_{\text{ILEC}} = 1$ (and high values are associated with good service), the same formula is used with the following interpretation:

$$H_{\text{CLEC}} = n_{\text{CLEC}} - P_{\text{CLEC}} n_{\text{CLEC}}$$

$$H_{\text{ILEC}} = n_{\text{ILEC}} - P_{\text{ILEC}} n_{\text{ILEC}}.$$

Of course if it is also true that $H_{\text{CLEC}} = 0$, then $P_{\text{FE}} = 1$ because the results are at parity.

For parity measures that are expressed as Rates or Ratios: a binomial test is used to calculate the probability of the data given the hypothesis of parity:

$$P_{\text{Rate}} = 1 - \sum_{x=0}^{H_{\text{CLEC}}-1} \binom{N}{x} p^x (1-p)^{N-x}$$

Where;

H_{CLEC} = numerator for the CLEC

H_{ILEC} = numerator for the ILEC

$$N = H_{\text{CLEC}} + H_{\text{ILEC}}$$

D_{CLEC} = denominator for CLEC

D_{ILEC} = denominator for ILEC

$$p = D_{CLEC} / (D_{CLEC} + D_{ILEC})$$

In calculating the difference between the performances the formulae given above apply when a larger CLEC value indicates a higher quality of performance. For cases in which a smaller CLEC value indicates a higher quality of performance the order of subtraction should be reversed (i.e., $M_{CLEC} - M_{ILEC}$, $P_{CLEC} - P_{ILEC}$).

For measures with benchmarks that are expressed as Averages or Means:

$$t = (\text{DIFF}) / \delta_{\text{DIFF}}$$

Where;

$$\text{DIFF} = M_{CLEC} - \text{BM}$$

M_{CLEC} = CLEC Average

BM = Benchmark

$$\delta_{\text{DIFF}} = \text{SQRT} [\delta_{CLEC}^2 (1/n_{CLEC})]$$

δ_{CLEC}^2 = Calculated variance for CLEC.

n_{CLEC} = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

The probability of the t statistic is obtained from Student's distribution with $n_{CLEC} - 1$ degrees of freedom.

For measures with benchmarks that are expressed as Percentages or Proportions:

When high proportions designate good service, the probability of the CLEC result is given by

$$\sum_{x=0}^K \binom{N}{x} B^x (1-B)^{N-x}$$

Where

$$K = PN$$

P = CLEC proportion

N = number of observations or samples used in CLEC measurement

B = benchmark expressed as a proportion

When low proportions designate good service, the probability of the CLEC result is given by

$$1 - \sum_{x=0}^{K-1} \binom{N}{x} B^x (1-B)^{N-x}$$

with the same definition of symbols as is given above.

8.3 The following table will be used for determining the critical probabilities that define the Performance Criterion as well as the number of non-compliant measures that may be excused in a given month. The table is read as follows: (1) determine the number of measures to which Liquidated Damages are applicable and which have sample sizes greater than or equal to 30 cases. Let this number be M. (2) Find the value of M in the columns of the table with the heading “M”. (3) To the immediate right of the value of M, find the value in the column labeled “F”. This is the maximum number of measures that may be failed when there are M measures being evaluated. (4)) To the immediate right of F in the column labeled “P” is the critical probability for determining compliance in each statistical test performed on the M measures. Statistical tests that yield probabilities less than this value indicate failures for the sub-measure.

9. TABLE OF CRITICAL VALUES

M	F	P	M	F	P	M	F	P	M	F	P	M	F	P	M	F	P
1	0	0.010	71	8	0.051	141	14	0.054	211	19	0.054	281	23	0.051	351	28	0.052
2	1	0.100	72	8	0.050	142	14	0.054	212	19	0.053	282	23	0.051	352	28	0.052
3	1	0.059	73	9	0.059	143	14	0.054	213	19	0.053	283	23	0.051	353	28	0.052
4	2	0.141	74	9	0.058	144	14	0.053	214	19	0.053	284	23	0.050	354	28	0.051
5	2	0.106	75	9	0.057	145	14	0.053	215	19	0.053	285	23	0.050	355	28	0.051
6	2	0.085	76	9	0.056	146	14	0.052	216	19	0.052	286	23	0.050	356	28	0.051
7	2	0.071	77	9	0.055	147	14	0.052	217	19	0.052	287	24	0.053	357	28	0.051
8	2	0.061	78	9	0.055	148	14	0.052	218	19	0.052	288	24	0.052	358	28	0.051
9	2	0.053	79	9	0.054	149	14	0.051	219	19	0.052	289	24	0.052	359	28	0.051
10	3	0.093	80	9	0.053	150	14	0.051	220	19	0.051	290	24	0.052	360	28	0.051
11	3	0.084	81	9	0.053	151	14	0.051	221	19	0.051	291	24	0.052	361	28	0.050
12	3	0.076	82	9	0.052	152	14	0.050	222	19	0.051	292	24	0.052	362	28	0.050
13	3	0.069	83	9	0.051	153	15	0.055	223	19	0.051	293	24	0.052	363	28	0.050
14	3	0.064	84	9	0.051	154	15	0.054	224	19	0.050	294	24	0.051	364	28	0.050
15	3	0.059	85	9	0.050	155	15	0.054	225	19	0.050	295	24	0.051	365	29	0.052
16	3	0.055	86	10	0.057	156	15	0.054	226	20	0.053	296	24	0.051	366	29	0.052
17	3	0.052	87	10	0.057	157	15	0.053	227	20	0.053	297	24	0.051	367	29	0.052
18	4	0.077	88	10	0.056	158	15	0.053	228	20	0.053	298	24	0.051	368	29	0.052
19	4	0.073	89	10	0.055	159	15	0.053	229	20	0.053	299	24	0.050	369	29	0.052
20	4	0.069	90	10	0.055	160	15	0.052	230	20	0.052	300	24	0.050	370	29	0.051
21	4	0.065	91	10	0.054	161	15	0.052	231	20	0.052	301	24	0.050	371	29	0.051
22	4	0.062	92	10	0.053	162	15	0.052	232	20	0.052	302	25	0.053	372	29	0.051
23	4	0.059	93	10	0.053	163	15	0.051	233	20	0.052	303	25	0.052	373	29	0.051
24	4	0.057	94	10	0.052	164	15	0.051	234	20	0.051	304	25	0.052	374	29	0.051

25	4	0.054	95	10	0.052	165	15	0.051	235	20	0.051	305	25	0.052	375	29	0.051
26	4	0.052	96	10	0.051	166	15	0.050	236	20	0.051	306	25	0.052	376	29	0.051
27	5	0.070	97	10	0.051	167	15	0.050	237	20	0.051	307	25	0.052	377	29	0.050
28	5	0.068	98	10	0.050	168	16	0.054	238	20	0.051	308	25	0.052	378	29	0.050
29	5	0.065	99	11	0.056	169	16	0.054	239	20	0.050	309	25	0.051	379	29	0.050
30	5	0.063	100	11	0.056	170	16	0.053	240	20	0.050	310	25	0.051	380	29	0.050
31	5	0.061	101	11	0.055	171	16	0.053	241	21	0.053	311	25	0.051	381	30	0.052
32	5	0.059	102	11	0.055	172	16	0.053	242	21	0.053	312	25	0.051	382	30	0.052
33	5	0.057	103	11	0.054	173	16	0.053	243	21	0.053	313	25	0.051	383	30	0.052
34	5	0.055	104	11	0.054	174	16	0.052	244	21	0.052	314	25	0.051	384	30	0.052
35	5	0.054	105	11	0.053	175	16	0.052	245	21	0.052	315	25	0.050	385	30	0.051
36	5	0.052	106	11	0.053	176	16	0.052	246	21	0.052	316	25	0.050	386	30	0.051
37	5	0.051	107	11	0.052	177	16	0.051	247	21	0.052	317	25	0.050	387	30	0.051
38	6	0.065	108	11	0.052	178	16	0.051	248	21	0.052	318	26	0.052	388	30	0.051
39	6	0.063	109	11	0.051	179	16	0.051	249	21	0.051	319	26	0.052	389	30	0.051
40	6	0.061	110	11	0.051	180	16	0.050	250	21	0.051	320	26	0.052	390	30	0.051
41	6	0.060	111	11	0.050	181	16	0.050	251	21	0.051	321	26	0.052	391	30	0.051
42	6	0.058	112	12	0.056	182	17	0.054	252	21	0.051	322	26	0.052	392	30	0.051
43	6	0.057	113	12	0.055	183	17	0.054	253	21	0.051	323	26	0.052	393	30	0.050
44	6	0.055	114	12	0.055	184	17	0.053	254	21	0.050	324	26	0.051	394	30	0.050
45	6	0.054	115	12	0.054	185	17	0.053	255	21	0.050	325	26	0.051	395	30	0.050
46	6	0.053	116	12	0.054	186	17	0.053	256	22	0.053	326	26	0.051	396	31	0.052
47	6	0.052	117	12	0.054	187	17	0.052	257	22	0.053	327	26	0.051	397	31	0.052
48	6	0.051	118	12	0.053	188	17	0.052	258	22	0.053	328	26	0.051	398	31	0.052
49	7	0.062	119	12	0.053	189	17	0.052	259	22	0.052	329	26	0.051	399	31	0.052
50	7	0.061	120	12	0.052	190	17	0.052	260	22	0.052	330	26	0.050	400	31	0.052
51	7	0.059	121	12	0.052	191	17	0.051	261	22	0.052	331	26	0.050	401	31	0.051
52	7	0.058	122	12	0.051	192	17	0.051	262	22	0.052	332	26	0.050	402	31	0.051
53	7	0.057	123	12	0.051	193	17	0.051	263	22	0.052	333	27	0.052	403	31	0.051
54	7	0.056	124	12	0.050	194	17	0.051	264	22	0.051	334	27	0.052	404	31	0.051
55	7	0.055	125	13	0.056	195	17	0.050	265	22	0.051	335	27	0.052	405	31	0.051
56	7	0.054	126	13	0.055	196	17	0.050	266	22	0.051	336	27	0.052	406	31	0.051
57	7	0.053	127	13	0.055	197	18	0.054	267	22	0.051	337	27	0.052	407	31	0.051
58	7	0.052	128	13	0.054	198	18	0.053	268	22	0.051	338	27	0.052	408	31	0.050
59	7	0.051	129	13	0.054	199	18	0.053	269	22	0.050	339	27	0.051	409	31	0.050
60	7	0.050	130	13	0.053	200	18	0.053	270	22	0.050	340	27	0.051	410	31	0.050
61	8	0.060	131	13	0.053	201	18	0.052	271	23	0.053	341	27	0.051	411	31	0.050
62	8	0.059	132	13	0.053	202	18	0.052	272	23	0.053	342	27	0.051	412	32	0.052
63	8	0.058	133	13	0.052	203	18	0.052	273	23	0.052	343	27	0.051	413	32	0.052
64	8	0.057	134	13	0.052	204	18	0.052	274	23	0.052	344	27	0.051	414	32	0.052
65	8	0.056	135	13	0.051	205	18	0.051	275	23	0.052	345	27	0.051	415	32	0.052
66	8	0.055	136	13	0.051	206	18	0.051	276	23	0.052	346	27	0.050	416	32	0.051
67	8	0.054	137	13	0.051	207	18	0.051	277	23	0.052	347	27	0.050	417	32	0.051
68	8	0.053	138	13	0.050	208	18	0.051	278	23	0.052	348	27	0.050	418	32	0.051
69	8	0.053	139	14	0.055	209	18	0.050	279	23	0.051	349	28	0.052	419	32	0.051
70	8	0.052	140	14	0.055	210	18	0.050	280	23	0.051	350	28	0.052	420	32	0.051

10. LIMITATIONS

- 10.1 AT&T Wisconsin will not be excused from payment of liquidated damages, as calculated by the rules set forth herein, on any grounds, except by application of the procedure provided for under Section 11.6. Any dispute regarding whether a AT&T Wisconsin performance failure is excused under that paragraph will be resolved, through negotiation, through a dispute resolution proceeding under applicable Commission rules or, if the parties agree, through commercial arbitration with the American Arbitration Association.
- 10.2 AT&T Wisconsin shall not be obligated to pay liquidated damages or assessments for noncompliance with a performance measurement to the extent that such noncompliance was the result of actions or events beyond AT&T Wisconsin's control, including but not limited to the following: (i) a Force Majeure event; (ii) an act or omission by CLEC that is contrary to any of its obligations under its interconnection agreement with AT&T Wisconsin or law; (iii) environmental events beyond AT&T Wisconsin's control even though not considered "Force Majeure"; (iv) problems associated with third-party systems or equipment which could not be avoided by AT&T Wisconsin through the exercise of reasonable diligence, regardless of whether or not such third-party systems or equipment were sold to or otherwise being provided to AT&T Wisconsin and (v) delays or other problems resulting from actions of a Service Bureau Provider acting on CLEC's behalf for connection to AT&T-LEC's OSS, including Service Bureau Provider processes, services, systems or connectivity.
- 10.3 If a Delaying Event (i) prevents a Party from performing an activity, then such activity will be excluded from the calculation of AT&T Wisconsin's compliance with the Performance Criteria, or (ii) only suspends AT&T Wisconsin's ability to timely perform the activity, the applicable time frame in which AT&T Wisconsin's compliance with the Performance Criteria is measured will be extended on an hour-for-hour or day-for-day basis, as applicable, equal to the duration of the Delaying Event.

11. RECORDS AND REPORTS

- 11.1 AT&T Wisconsin will not levy a separate charge for provision of the data to CLEC called for under this Appendix. Notwithstanding other provisions of this Agreement, the Parties agree that such data and associated records will be deemed Proprietary Information.
- 11.2 Reports are to be made available to CLEC by the 20th day following the close of the calendar month. If the 20th day falls on a weekend or holiday, the reports will be made available the next business day.
- 11.3 CLEC will have access to monthly reports through an interactive Website.

- 11.4 AT&T Wisconsin will provide billing credits or other payment remittance options as may be ordered by the Commission or FCC for the associated liquidated damages on or before the 30th day following the due date of the performance report for the month in which the obligation arose.
- 11.5 The measurement data herein shall be collected, reported and used to calculate payments or penalties on a per CLEC operating entity basis. The results of multiple CLEC affiliates shall not be combined for any purpose under this Appendix.
- 11.6 AT&T Wisconsin will not pay liquidated damages in excess of the monthly maximum amounts listed in the table below unless so ordered by the Commission or the FCC. These thresholds are based on the aggregate damages to all CLECs in the designated state.

State	Monthly Maximum
Arkansas	\$.072M
California	\$1.26M
Connecticut	\$.168M
Illinois	\$.51M
Indiana	\$.165M
Kansas	\$.101M
Michigan	\$.392M
Missouri	\$.189M
Nevada	\$.024M
Ohio	\$.296M
Oklahoma	\$.120M
Texas	\$.713M
Wisconsin	\$.158M

12. AUDITS

- 12.1 CLEC and AT&T Wisconsin will consult with one another and attempt in good faith to resolve any issues regarding the accuracy or integrity of data collected, generated, and reported pursuant to this Appendix. In the event that CLEC requests such consultation and the issues raised by CLEC have not been resolved within 30 days after CLEC's request for consultation, then AT&T Wisconsin will allow CLEC to commence a mini-audit, at CLEC's expense, upon providing AT&T Wisconsin 5 days advance written notice (including e-mail).

- 12.2 CLEC is limited to auditing three (3) single measures/submeasures during the year (hereafter, “Mini-Audits”). No more than three (3) Mini-Audits will be conducted simultaneously for all CLECs, unless more than one CLEC wants the same measure/sub-measure audited at the same time, in which case, Mini-Audits of the same measure/submeasure shall count as one Mini-Audit for the purposes of this paragraph only.
- 12.3 CLEC will bear the expense of the mini-audits, unless AT&T Wisconsin is found to be “materially” misreporting or misrepresenting data or to have non-compliant procedures, in which case, AT&T Wisconsin will pay for the costs of the third party auditor. “Materially” at fault means that a reported successful measure changes as a consequence of the audit to a missed measure, or there is a change from an ordinary missed measure to another category, if such exists. Each party to the mini-audit shall bear its own internal costs, regardless of which party ultimately bears the costs of the third party auditor. The major service categories are listed below:

Pre-Ordering/Ordering
Provisioning
Maintenance
Interconnection
Coordinated Conversions
Collocation
Billing

13. INITIAL IMPLEMENTATION

- 13.1 The Parties agree that none of the liquidated damages provisions set forth in this Appendix will apply during the first three months after first purchases of the a new type of service or unbundled network element(s) associated with a particular Performance Measurement or after the introduction of a new measure, unless AT&T Wisconsin is ordered to do so by the Commission or the FCC. During this three-month period the Parties agree to consider in good faith any adjustments that may be warranted to the Performance Criteria for that Performance Measurement.

14. PERFORMANCE MEASUREMENTS

- 14.1 AT&T Wisconsin will provide Performance Measurements under this Agreement, in accordance with the Business Rules and associated implementation timelines contained in paragraphs 23 and 24 of the FCC Merger Conditions, and

its associated Attachments. Except as otherwise provided herein, the Performance Measure Business Rules contained in the FCC Merger Conditions, including any subsequent additions, modifications and/or deletions to the Business Rules adopted pursuant to FCC Merger Conditions, Attachment A, paragraph 4, shall also be incorporated into this Agreement by reference. As provided in Section 7.1 herein, liquidated damages apply to available, non-diagnostic measurements of the FCC Merger Conditions, when **AT&T Wisconsin** delivers non-compliant performance as defined in 3.1.3. **AT&T Wisconsin** will also report results for any measurements that have been ordered by the Commission that approved this agreement, liquidated damages shall not apply to such measurements. When the Commission issues an order instituting performance remedies, either party may invoke Section 21 of the General Terms and Conditions of this Agreement. **AT&T Wisconsin** performance shall be measured by the Business Rules in effect on the first date of each month in which the activity subject to measurement occurred.